

MICHELE BEAL BAGNERIS, City Attorney
State Bar No. 115423
mbagneris@cityofpasadena.net
ARNOLD F. LEE, Chief Assistant City Attorney
State Bar No. 278610
aflee@cityofpasadena.net
100 N. Garfield Avenue, Suite N210
Pasadena, CA 91101
Telephone: (626) 744-4141
Facsimile: (626) 744-4190

Nathan A. Oyster (SBN 225307)
E-mail: noyster@bwsllaw.com
Caylin W. Jones (SBN 327829)
E-mail: cjones@bwsllaw.com
BURKE, WILLIAMS & SORESENSEN, LLP
444 South Flower Street, 40th Floor
Los Angeles, California 90071-2942
Tel: 213.236.0600 Fax: 213.236.2700

Attorneys for Defendant CITY OF
PASADENA

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

DAISY ALVAREZ, individually and as
successor in interest to Ricardo
Andrade, deceased,

Plaintiff,

v.

CITY OF PASADENA and DOES 1-
10, inclusive,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:25-cv-02490-MWF-PVC

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

Magistrate Judge: Pedro V. Castillo

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may

1 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
2 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
3 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
4 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
5 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
6 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth
7 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
8 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
9 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party
10 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

11 1.2 GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

12 This action relates to the officer involved shooting of Decedent Ricardo
13 Andrade. The parties submit that good cause exists to enter the proposed protective
14 order to balance Defendant's concern regarding the ongoing investigation into the
15 shooting, autopsy photographs, and concerns regarding witnesses' identities. Further,
16 confidential medical records regarding the decedent are likely to be subpoenaed
17 and/or produced during the course of litigation.

18 **2. DEFINITIONS**

19 2.1 Action: This pending federal lawsuit entitled Daisy Alvarez v. City
20 of Pasadena, Case No. 2:25-cv-02490-MWF-PVC

21 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
22 designation of information or items under this Order.

23 2.3 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of
24 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
25 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
26 the Good Cause Statement.

27 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
28 their support staff).

1 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
2 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
3 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

4 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
5 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
6 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
7 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

8 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
9 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
10 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

11 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
12 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
13 counsel.

14 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
15 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

16 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a
17 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
18 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
19 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

20 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
21 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
22 support staffs).

23 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
24 Discovery Material in this Action.

25 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
26 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
27 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
28 and their employees and subcontractors.

1 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
2 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

3 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
4 Material from a Producing Party.

5 **3. SCOPE**

6 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
7 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
8 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
9 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
10 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

11 Any use of Protected Material at trial will be governed by the orders of the
12 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

13 **4. DURATION**

14 Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the information that was designated as
15 confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and will
16 be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press, unless
17 compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are
18 made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. See *Kamakana v. City and County of*
19 *Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing “good cause”
20 showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons”
21 standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the
22 terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

23 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

24 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.
25 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
26 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
27 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
28 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written

1 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
2 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
3 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

4 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
5 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
6 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
7 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
8 Party to sanctions.

9 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
10 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
11 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

12 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
13 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
14 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
15 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
16 produced.

17 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

18 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,
19 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that
20 the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter
21 "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a
22 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
23 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
24 markings in the margins).

25 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
26 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
27 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
28 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection will be

1 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
2 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
3 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before
4 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
5 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
6 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
7 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
8 markings in the margins).

9 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the
10 Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all
11 protected testimony.

12 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
13 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
14 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
15 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
16 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, will identify the protected
17 portion(s).

18 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
19 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
20 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
21 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
22 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
23 Order.

24 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

25 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
26 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
27 Scheduling Order.

1 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party will initiate the dispute
2 resolution process (and, if necessary, file a discovery motion) under Local Rule 37.1
3 et seq.

4 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding will be on
5 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
6 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
7 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
8 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties will
9 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
10 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
11 challenge.

12 7. **ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

13 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
14 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
15 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
16 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
17 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
18 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
19 DISPOSITION).

20 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
21 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
22 authorized under this Order.

23 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
24 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating **Party**, a
25 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
26 "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

27 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well
28 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary

1 to disclose the information for this Action;

2 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
3 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

4 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
5 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
6 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

7 (d) the Court and its personnel;

8 (e) court reporters and their staff;

9 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
10 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
11 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

12 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
13 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

14 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
15 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
16 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they
17 will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
18 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
19 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
20 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may
21 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except
22 as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

23 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
24 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

25 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**
26 **PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

27 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
28 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as

1 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

2 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification will
3 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

4 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
5 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
6 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification will include a copy of
7 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

8 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
9 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

10 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
11 the subpoena or court order will not produce any information designated in this
12 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
13 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
14 permission. The Designating Party will bear the burden and expense of seeking
15 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
16 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
17 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

18 **9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
19 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

20 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
21 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
22 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
23 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
24 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

25 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
26 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
27 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
28 confidential information, then the Party will:

1 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that
2 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
3 with a Non-Party;

4 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective
5 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific
6 description of the information requested; and

7 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
8 Party, if requested.

9 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
10 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
11 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
12 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party will
13 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
14 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
15 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party will bear the burden and expense
16 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

17 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED**
18 **MATERIAL**

19 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
20 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
21 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
22 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
23 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
24 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
25 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
26 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

1 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
2 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

3 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
4 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
5 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
6 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever
7 procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production
8 without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and
9 (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a
10 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work
11 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated
12 protective order submitted to the court.

13 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

14 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
15 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

16 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
17 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
18 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
19 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
20 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

21 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
22 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
23 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
24 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
25 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
26 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

1 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

2 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
3 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
4 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
5 this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
6 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
7 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
8 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
9 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
10 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
11 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
12 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
13 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
14 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
15 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
16 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
17 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
18 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
19 Section 4 (DURATION).

20 14. Any willful violation of this Order may be punished by civil or criminal
21 contempt proceedings, financial or evidentiary sanctions, reference to disciplinary
22 authorities, or other appropriate action at the discretion of the Court.

23
24 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
25
26
27
28

1 Dated: May 21, 2025

BURKE, WILLIAMS & SORESENSEN, LLP

2
3
4 By: /s/ Caylin W. Jones

Nathan A. Oyster

Caylin W. Jones

Attorneys for Defendant

CITY OF PASADENA

5
6
7
8 Dated: May 21, 2025

LAW OFFICES OF DALE K. GALIPO

9
10
11 By: /s/ Renee V. Masongsong

Dale K. Galipo

Renee V. Masongsong

Attorneys for Plaintiff

12
13
14
15 Dated: May 21, 2025

CONLOGUE LAW, LLP

16
17
18 By: /s/ Kevin S. Conlogue

Kevin S. Conlogue

Ashley M. Conlogue

Attorneys for Plaintiff

19
20
21
22 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

23
24 DATED: _____

HON. PEDRO V. CASTILLO

United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [full name], of _____ [full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on _____ [date] in the case of **Daisy Alvarez v. City of Pasadena, Case No. 2:25-cv-02490-MWF-PVC** I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [full name] of _____ [full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____